Michael Freund SBN 99687 1915 Addison Street Berkeley, CA 94704 Telephone: (510) 540-1992

Facsimile: (510) 540-5543

Attorney for Plaintiff
Center for Environmental Health

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH a California non-profit corporation,

CASE NO. C 08-03250 WHA

Plaintiff.

STIPULATION OF PARTIES IN SUPPORT OF REMAND; ORDER (Proposed)

EASTERN AMERICA TRIO PRODUCTS, INC.

Trial: November 30, 2009

and DOES I-X,

Ψ,

Defendants.

The parties through their respective counsel hereby stipulate that plaintiff Center for Environmental Health does not have standing to bring a Proposition 65 case in federal court and therefore this court does not have jurisdiction over this case. The parties stipulate that the federal court does not have jurisdiction in cases seeking to enforce the warning provisions of Proposition 65. Toxic Injuries Corporation v. Safety-Kleen Corporation, 57 F. Supp. 2d 947 (C.D. Cal. 1999).

Counsel for Defendant, Eastern America Trio Products, Inc. ("Defendant"), removed this case in good faith, being unaware of the above-cited case and rule, and notes that the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals, in a case involving both the citizen-suit provision of the federal Clean

Water Act and California's Proposition 65, Ecological Rights Foundation and Mateel

Environmental Justice Foundation, 230 F.3d 1141 (9th Cir. 2000), found standing, but did so in an opinion that only mentioned the Clean Water Act and not Proposition 65. Defendant accordingly agrees with Plaintiff that this Court lacks jurisdiction because Plaintiff lacks the required standing.

Each party will bear its own costs attorney's fees incurred during the time this case was pending in this Court.

Accordingly, the parties respectfully request that this Court remand the case to the Superior Court of the State of California for Alameda County where the case was initially filed.

Dated: August 6, 2009

LAW OFFICES OF MICHAEL FREUND

Michael Freund

Attorney for Plaintiff

Center for Environmental Health

Dated: July 31, 2009 LIU & SHIELDS LLP

Carolyn Shields

Attorney for Defendant

Eastern America Trio Products, Inc.

## <u>ORDER</u>

GOOD CAUSE APPEARING, this case is remanded to the Alameda County Superior Court.

DATED: August 31, 2009.

